
**Thomas P. DiNapoli
COMPTROLLER**



Audit Objectives 2

Audit Results - Summary 2

Background 2

**Audit Findings and
Recommendations 3**

Recommendations 3

Audit Scope and Methodology 3

Authority 4

Reporting Requirements 4

Contributors to the Report 4

Exhibit A 5

**Appendix A - Auditees'
Responses 6**

**OFFICE OF THE
NEW YORK STATE COMPTROLLER**

**DIVISION OF STATE
GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY**

MULTI-AGENCY

**BUILDING SECURITY
SERVICES**

Report 2006-S-100

AUDIT OBJECTIVES

The objectives of our audit were to determine whether the Office of General Services (OGS) has taken appropriate steps to reassess and mitigate its buildings' security risks since September 11, 2001, and whether 20 other selected State agencies identified in Exhibit A of this report have formally assessed their buildings' security risks and prepared security plans for them.

AUDIT RESULTS - SUMMARY

We found that OGS has taken appropriate steps to reassess its buildings' security risks since September 11, 2001, and has worked with the Division of State Police (DSP) to perform detailed security risk assessments for the buildings. We also found OGS has made numerous security enhancements on the basis of these risk assessments. At the other 20 State agencies, we found that various actions have been taken in relation to building security.

The detailed results of our audit were provided to OGS and agency officials during the course of our audit. These details are not included here due to the sensitivity of the information. Generally, we determined that certain actions needed to be taken by OGS and some of the agencies. OGS and DSP have the most experience of any of the audited agencies in matters relating to building security. Accordingly, our report contains two recommendations to take advantage of opportunities for other agencies to consult with OGS and DSP on these matters and for OGS and DSP to assist any agencies seeking such advice. OGS and other agency officials generally agreed with our recommendations and have taken steps to implement changes.

This report, dated January 4, 2008, is available on our website at: <http://www.osc.state.ny.us>. Add or update your mailing list address by contacting us at: (518) 474-3271 or Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
110 State Street, 11th Floor
Albany, NY 12236

BACKGROUND

New York State agencies own or lease space in hundreds of buildings, which are used for a variety of purposes. The level of security at these buildings varies depending on the needs. Since the attacks of September 11, 2001, the issue of physical security at State facilities has become increasingly critical. Agencies have moved to strengthen security procedures across the State through building access restrictions, screening of mail and packages, and increased verification of employees' and visitors' identification. Some agencies hire their own security staffs to perform these functions, while others avail themselves of statewide contracts let by OGS. Still others negotiate their own private contracts with security firms.

OGS owns or leases space in 631 buildings, the most of any State agency. Most of these buildings are used by other State agencies. OGS owns 41 of these buildings and leases space in the remaining 590. The buildings owned by OGS include such high-profile buildings as the State Capitol, the Legislative Office Building, and various other buildings at the Empire State Plaza in Albany. OGS also owns other State office buildings in and around Albany, and several State office buildings outside of Albany.

In addition to OGS, there are a number of other State agencies that own or lease space in buildings. There is no authoritative listing of

these buildings, but we were able to determine that, excluding the State University of New York (SUNY), these other State agencies own or lease space in a total of 1,880 buildings (owning 856 and leasing space in 1,024). A total of 21 State agencies, including OGS, were addressed by our audit.

AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

We found that OGS has taken appropriate steps to reassess its buildings' security risks since September 11, 2001, and has worked with the Division of State Police to perform detailed security risk assessments for the buildings. We also found OGS has made numerous security enhancements on the basis of these risk assessments. At the other 20 State agencies, we found that various actions have been taken in relation to building security.

The detailed results of our audit were provided to OGS and agency officials during the course of our audit. These details are not included here due to the sensitivity of the information. Generally, we determined that certain actions needed to be taken by OGS and some of the agencies. OGS has the most experience of any of the audited agencies in matters relating to building security. Accordingly, there is an opportunity for these agencies to consult with OGS on these matters and for OGS to assist any agencies seeking such advice. OGS and other agency officials generally agreed with our recommendations and have taken steps to implement changes.

Recommendations

1. Implement the specific recommendations provided to the 21 agencies' officials during the audit.

2. Agencies consult, as necessary, with OGS about building security matters and OGS assist these agencies with their inquiries.

AUDIT SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

We conducted our performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. We audited selected aspects of building security for certain of the buildings owned by OGS and certain of the buildings owned or leased by 20 other State agencies identified in Exhibit A of this report. Our audit covered the period September 11, 2001, through April 13, 2007.

To accomplish our objectives, we interviewed officials from OGS, the State Division of the Budget, the Division of State Police, the State Office of Homeland Security, and the 20 other agencies selected for review. We also reviewed OGS' policies, the building security risk assessments performed by OGS and the Division of State Police, the security enhancement plan developed by OGS on the basis of the risk assessments, OGS reports describing the security enhancements made in accordance with that plan, and the individual building security plans prepared by OGS. At the other 20 State agencies, we reviewed the building security risk assessments performed by these agencies, as well as any building security plans that they prepared as a result.

To identify the buildings that are owned and leased by State agencies, we reviewed data from New York State's Fixed Asset Accounting System (which is maintained by OGS) and the websites of individual State agencies, and interviewed agency officials. After we identified these buildings, we judgmentally selected the 20 agencies listed in Exhibit A (in addition to OGS) for further review. We selected these 20 agencies because they occupied the greatest number of buildings. For our review of these 20

agencies' building security risk assessments and security plans, we addressed only the buildings that contained 50 or more State occupants (i.e., State employees or customers/clients, not private tenants). There was a total of 212 such buildings.

At 33 of the 41 buildings owned by OGS, we observed actual security practices. We made these observations when we toured the buildings with the building managers and also when we conducted unannounced visits both during and after normal business hours. We judgmentally selected these 33 buildings for review. In making our selections, we chose the buildings with the greatest security risks.

In addition to being the State Auditor, the Comptroller performs certain other constitutionally and statutorily mandated duties as the chief fiscal officer of New York State. These include operating the State's accounting system; preparing the State's financial statements; and approving State contracts, refunds, and other payments. In addition, the Comptroller appoints members to certain boards, commissions, and public authorities, some of whom have minority voting rights. These duties may be considered management functions for purposes of evaluating organizational independence under generally accepted government auditing standards. In our opinion, these functions do not affect our ability to conduct independent audits of program performance.

AUTHORITY

This audit was performed pursuant to the State Comptroller's authority as set forth in Article V, Section 1 of the State Constitution and Article II, Section 8 of the State Finance Law.

REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Draft copies of this report were provided to heads of each of the 21 agencies for their review and written comment. Officials generally agreed with our observations and recommendations. Six agencies chose to provide written comments, which were considered in preparing this report and are included as Appendix A.

Within 90 days of the final release of this report, as required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, the heads of each of the 21 agencies listed in Exhibit A shall report to the Governor, the State Comptroller, and the leaders of the Legislature and fiscal committees, advising what steps were taken to implement the recommendations contained in this report, and if the recommendations are not implemented, the reasons why.

CONTRIBUTORS TO THE REPORT

Major contributors to this report were Frank Houston, John Buyce, Joel Biederman, Greg Petschke, Donald Cosgrove, Diane Hardy, Richard Podagrosi, and David Reilly.

Listing of Agencies Selected for Security Planning Review

Banking Department
Insurance Department
Department of Agriculture and Markets
Department of Environmental Conservation
Department of Health
Department of Labor
Department of Motor Vehicles
Department of Taxation and Finance
Department of Transportation
Division of Criminal Justice Services
Division of Housing and Community Renewal
Housing Finance Agency
Office of Alcoholism and Substance Abuse Services
Office of Children and Family Services
Office of Mental Health
Office of Mental Retardation and Developmental Disabilities
Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation
State Education Department
State Insurance Fund
Workers Compensation Board

APPENDIX A - AUDITEES' RESPONSES



ELIOT SPITZER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF NEW YORK
EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT
OFFICE OF GENERAL SERVICES
MAYOR ERASTUS CORNING 2ND TOWER
THE GOVERNOR NELSON A. ROCKEFELLER EMPIRE STATE PLAZA
ALBANY, NEW YORK 12242

JOHN C. EGAN
COMMISSIONER

TRINA MEAD
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER
ADMINISTRATION

December 4, 2007

John Buyce
Audit Manager
110 State Street
Albany, New York 12236

Dear Mr. Buyce,

We are writing in response to your audit report number 2006-S-100, regarding selected aspects of building security.

Overall, OGS is pleased that your audit did not find serious deficiencies in the design or implementation of our security measures. Additionally, your report confirms that our efforts to provide security at OGS operated buildings is generally functioning as designed.

The security of our employees, visitors and tenants is of paramount importance to OGS. We base our security plans on risk assessments, and believe that our plans and processes have been well designed. However, because OGS considers the security of our buildings vital, we have already taken steps to address some of the issues listed in your report, and we are taking action to resolve the issues that will require longer term efforts.

OGS will continue to strive to protect our tenants, employees and visitors through further improvements to our security systems.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Trina Mead".

Trina Mead

cc: Commissioner John C. Egan
William Hill
Robert Curtin
Rad Anderson





STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF TAXATION AND FINANCE
W.A. HARRIMAN CAMPUS
ALBANY, NY 12227

Barbara G. Billet
Acting Commissioner

December 3, 2007

Mr. John Buyce
Audit Manager
Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
110 State Street, 11th Floor
Albany, New York 12236

Dear Mr. Buyce:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on your draft audit report, "Statewide Building Security, (2006-S-100)."

As a Department, we have always been serious in our commitment to mitigate building security risks and establish appropriate building security measures.

We are especially pleased with your findings that the Department has building security risk assessments and security plans for our leased space at non-OGS buildings. We will continue to periodically update our building security risk assessments and security plans as recommended by your auditors. Also, we will continue to test and monitor the security plans.

Again, thank you for the opportunity to comment and we value OSC's suggestions on ways to better secure our operations.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Barbara G. Billet".

Barbara G. Billet
Acting Commissioner



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
ALBANY, NY 12232
www.nysdot.gov

ASTRID C. GLYNN
COMMISSIONER

ELIOT SPITZER
GOVERNOR

December 7, 2007

Ms. John Buyce
Audit Manager
Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
110 State St., 11th Floor
Albany, NY 12236

Re: Working Draft Report #2006-S-100
Building Security

Dear Mr. Buyce:

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to the subject report. Below is the Department of Transportation's (Department) response.

Recommendation 1: *Implement the specific recommendations provided to the 21 agencies' officials during the audit.*

Response: We agree. The Department will implement its one recommendation by December 31, 2008.

Recommendation 2: *Agencies consult, as necessary, with OGS about building security matters and OGS assist these agencies with their inquiries.*

Response: We agree. The Department will consult with the Office of General Services as needed.

If you require additional information, please contact Robert Keihm at (518) 457-6446.

Sincerely,

Stanley Geo
Executive Deputy Commissioner

cc: Ms. Lisa Ng, Division of the Budget



THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT / THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK / ALBANY, NY 12234

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FOR OPERATIONS
AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES
Tel. (518) 474-2547
Fax (518) 473-2827
E-mail: tsevo@mail.nysed.gov

November 29, 2007

Mr. John Buyce
Audit Director
Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
110 State Street – 11th Floor
Albany, NY 12236

Dear Mr. Buyce:

The following is the New York State Education Department's (SED) response to the draft audit report (2006-S-100) on Building Security. We have carefully considered the recommendations that were provided in the preliminary audit findings and intend to implement them.

Recommendation 1:

Implement the specific recommendations provided to the 21 agencies' officials during the audit.

We agree with this recommendation.

Recommendation 2:

Agencies consult, as necessary, with OGS about building security matters and OGS assist these agencies with their inquiries.

We will continue to consult with OGS and other appropriate agencies regarding matters of building security.

If you have any questions regarding this response, please contact George Webb, Director, Office of Facilities and Business Management Services at (518) 474-7770.

Sincerely,

Theresa E. Savo

c: George Webb
James Conway



New York State Housing Finance Agency
State of New York Mortgage Agency

641 Lexington Avenue, New York, NY 10022
(212) 688-4000 • Fax: (212) 872-0789



PRISCILLA ALMODOVAR
President/CEO

December 4, 2007

Mr. John Buyce
Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
110 State Street - 11th Floor
Albany, N.Y. 12236

Dear Sir:

We have received the working draft of the Building Security Report (2006-S-100). After reviewing the content in the report, Agency management is of the opinion that its response submitted in April 2007 continues to be applicable. We have no further comments at this time.

Sincerely,

Stephen B. Chohey
Vice President/Internal Audit



**NEW YORK STATE
DEPARTMENT OF MOTOR VEHICLES
AUDIT SERVICES**

DAVID J. SWARTS
Commissioner

EDWARD J. WADE
Director of Audit Services

December 3, 2007

Mr. John Buyce, Audit Manager
Office of the State Comptroller
110 State Street
Albany, NY 12236

Re: 2006-S-100 Draft Audit Report

Dear Mr. Buyce:

This letter is in reference to the New York State Comptroller's draft audit report number 2006-S-100, regarding building security for State owned buildings and leased buildings. This letter is to inform you of the steps we have taken to implement recommendations contained in the above mentioned audit report.

1. Implement the specific recommendations provided to the 21 agencies' officials during the audit.

We have taken appropriate steps to address the DMV-specific recommendations.

2. Agencies consult, as necessary, with OGS about building security matters and OGS assist these agencies with their inquiries.

We have been consulting with OGS and the Department's investigators on security matters, and will continue to do so.

We will continue to look for areas to enhance security over DMV facilities. If you have any questions concerning this matter, please contact me at (518) 474-0881.

Sincerely,

Edward J. Wade
Director of Audit Services

SIX EMPIRE STATE PLAZA • ROOM 321A • ALBANY, NY • 12228
PHONE: 518-474-0881 • FAX: 518-474-8358