

347 Madison Avenue  
New York, NY 10017-3739  
212 878-7200 Tel  
212 878-7030 Fax

**Jay H. Walder**  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer



## Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

RECEIVED  
EXECUTIVE CHAMBER

December 8, 2010

OFFICE OF THE STATE COMPTROLLER  
THOMAS P. DINAPOLI  
COMPTROLLER

Honorable David A. Paterson  
Governor of New York  
Executive Chamber  
State Capitol  
Albany, NY 12224

Honorable Thomas P. DiNapoli  
Office of the State Comptroller  
633 Third Avenue, 31<sup>st</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10017

Re: 90-Day Response to Report #2009-S-92 MTA Metro-North Recycling Program

Gentlemen:

On August 26, 2010, the Office of the State Comptroller issued the above referenced audit report. As required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, I am providing you with the attached response which addresses the recommendations contained in the report.

A copy of the final audit report is attached for your convenience.

Sincerely,

Jay H. Walder  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer

Attachments

*The agencies of the MTA*

MTA New York City Transit  
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Long Island Bus  
MTA Metro-North Railroad

MTA Bridges and Tunnels  
MTA Capital Construction

MTA Bus Company



## Metro-North Railroad

November 22, 2010

Mr. Jay H. Walder  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
347 Madison Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
New York, NY 10017

**RE: 90 Day Response to MTA Metro-North Railroad Recycling Program Audit Final Report (2009-S-92)**

Dear Chairman Walder:

As required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, detailed below are the updated actions that have been taken to address the recommendations contained in the Final Report of the Recycling Program Audit performed by the Office of the State Comptroller. Metro-North continues to improve upon our existing recycling programs within the resources we have available.

Recommendation 1:

Perform a risk assessment to determine the materials handled at each location and the need based on the value and volume to verify the weight of scrap metal removed by vendors and ensure that vendors pay based on the correct weight.

MNR Response to Recommendation 1:

Metro-North has awarded a new contract for the removal and disposal of miscellaneous scrap metal generated primarily from MNR's shop/yard facilities. All scrap removals are processed through the Contractor's facility. The Contractor's weight scales have the appropriate state and local certifications and the weighing of each container is videotaped. Weight tickets are system generated and forwarded to the Assistant Director, Asset Recovery.

Procurement and Material Management (P&MM) has conducted its initial random inspection of Contractors handling both high volume/dollar value material and miscellaneous scrap metals. Both Contractors were found to be in compliance. An additional random inspection will be conducted prior to the end of the year.

Recommendation 2:

Communicate recycling requirements to Metro-North employees and monitor compliance.

MNR Response to Recommendation 2:

As a part of the start-up of the new recycling contract, correspondence has been forwarded to the various field supervisors responsible for disposition of scrap material identifying the correct methods of disposal. This correspondence included the distribution of form books to log the actual removal of scrap material, and instructions to forward all completed forms to the Assistant Director, Asset Recovery.

In addition, MNR is now including information on its recycling program as part of the annual environmental training program for Operations employees (approximately 800 employees). MNR's recycling efforts were described in the May 24, 2010 issue of the *Weekly News*, (MNR's weekly employee newsletter), and additional articles are planned. MNR will continue to identify other appropriate means to disseminate recycling information to its employees.

Recommendation 3:

Expedite the completion of system improvements to ensure all of the required information is collected and reported in the annual report.

MNR Response to Recommendation 3:

MNR has now awarded new agreements for recycling of consumer type recyclables, including paper and bottles/cans. These new agreements place new monthly record keeping requirements on those vendors to provide recycling report data. The process has improved with the new vendors, who are complying with the requirements, and the recycling information will be readily available for incorporation into the annual report.

We believe this addresses the recommendations of the Office of the State Comptroller. Thank you and feel free to contact me should you require additional information.

Sincerely,



Howard Permut

cc: K. Malloy, MTA Audit Services  
A. Bombace  
K. Timko  
A. Stapler  
K. Lambregtse  
N. Gilbertson